



**Report of the Chief Planning Officer**

**PLANS PANEL WEST**

**Date: 29<sup>th</sup> October 2009**

**Subject: 09/03665/FU – Detached double garage to side, single storey rear extension and conversion of existing garage to habitable room, 66 Clara Drive, Calverley, Pudsey, LS28 5QP**

**APPLICANT**

Mr K Wade

**DATE VALID**

3<sup>RD</sup> September 2009

**TARGET DATE**

29<sup>th</sup> October 2009

**Electoral Wards Affected:**

**Calverley & Pudsey**

Ward Member consulted

**Specific Implications For:**

Equality and Diversity

Community Cohesion

Narrowing the Gap

**RECOMMENDATION:**

**REFUSE: For the following reason**

The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed detached garage and rear extension by virtue of their size, siting and design are disproportionate additions to the host dwelling, (when considered with the new dwelling as constructed), which introduces an element of sprawl to the site, producing development harmful to the openness of the Green Belt and Special Landscape Area. As no very special circumstances have been demonstrated the proposal is inappropriate development within the Green Belt which contravenes Policies N12, N33 and N37 of the Leeds Unitary Development Plan (Review) 2006 and advice within Planning Policy Guidance 2 - Green Belts.

**1.0 INTRODUCTION**

1.1 The application is brought to Plans Panel at the request of Councillor Andrew Carter.

## **2.0 PROPOSAL**

- 2.1 The applicant seeks planning permission for the conversion of the existing integral garage at the dwelling to a habitable room, replacing the existing garage door with a window.
- 2.2 Further to this, the applicant seeks to introduce a new detached double garage, offset from the south western elevation of the dwelling by 2.3 metres. This garage is proposed to feature a dual pitched roof, faced in tile producing a gable to the south-west and north east elevations. The garage is proposed to be 6.5 metres in length, 6 metres wide, and 3 metres to the eaves and 5.5 metres to the ridge of the roof. The garage is proposed to be faced in stone to match the host.
- 2.3 In addition to these proposed changes, the applicant seeks to extend the dwelling to the rear. The applicant proposes to introduce a single storey extension, projecting 3 metres from the existing living room. The extension will be 7.08 metres wide with the existing roof above the living room continuing on to cover the new extension at the same degree of pitch as existing. Coursed stone facing and artificial stone slates, form the proposed materials.

## **3.0 SITE AND SURROUNDINGS:**

- 3.1 The host is a newly constructed dwelling granted permission in 2007. It forms part of Clara Drive, a secluded street comprising of detached dwellings, set back from the highway, each with their own individual character. This dwelling as constructed features a dual pitch tiled roof with one flat and one pitched roof dormer to the front elevation. A small bay window sits to the side. Both side boundaries are protected by dense planting and/or fencing of various heights. To the rear of the application site lies woodland, with the garden space of the dwelling set right back into this leafy area.
- 3.2 The host dwelling is larger than appears from the highway, with a long projection into the site, but a frontage of limited scale. The dwelling features a raised balcony area that links the front portion of the dwelling to the more elongated rear element. The dwelling features a combination of symmetrically and asymmetrically pitched dual pitched roofs and is constructed of stone.
- 3.3 The dwelling features a large turning/parking area to the front, of suitable dimensions to allow for the off street parking of a number of vehicles whilst still allowing safe access and egress.
- 3.4 The application site is within the Calverley Conservation Area.

## **4.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY:**

### **Planning Applications**

Reference: 07/01166/FU

Address: 66 Clara Drive, Calverley

Proposal: Four bedroom detached dwelling with integral single garage to replace existing dwelling and 1.5m high wall and railings to front boundary

Status: Approved

Decision Date: 09-NOV-07

Reference: 09/01348/FU

Address: 66 Clara Drive

Calverley

Proposal: Conversion of integral garage to form habitable room, single storey rear extension and double garage to side

Status: Refused

Decision Date: 20-MAY-09

## 5.0 HISTORY OF NEGOTIATIONS:

### 5.1 07/01166/FU – Four bedroom detached dwelling, November 2007

The property is set within a defined Special Landscape Area, within a Green Belt Location and within the Calverley Conservation Area and the negotiated approval for the host dwelling itself in (2007) acknowledged that the host dwelling as proposed under 07/01166/FU was, in terms of PPG2, 'materially larger' unacceptable with respect to the percentage increase in cubic volume beyond the dwelling it replaced.

The report for that approval stated that planning histories are material considerations and may act as very special circumstances. Information was submitted by the applicant at the time, showing comparative increases in volume along Clara Drive including extant permission for an extension at the host dwelling of 81% and on balance, the Local Planning Authority accepted that a replacement dwelling equating to an increase of 87% above the volume of the original dwelling was acceptable, given the local circumstances, previous local employment of the now defunct policy GB8 (which allowed for increases of up to 100% in the Green Belt) and examples of Inspectors allowing for a 100% increase on appeal.

### 5.2 09/01348/FU - Conversion of integral garage to form habitable room, single storey rear extension and double garage to side

Consistent with the approach taken under application 07/01166/FU, the garage structure proposed was considered unacceptable with respect to the previously negotiated approval for the dwelling in situ, introducing a garage with a further 268 cubic metres of volume. Although the extensions proposed under this application constituted less than 50% of the original volume of the *new* dwelling, they took the volume well above the 100% increase of the previous dwelling and therefore the introduction of a structure of such size would, be a disproportionate addition, contrary to national and local Green Belt policies.

## 6.0 PUBLIC/LOCAL RESPONSE:

One letter of support has been received from the occupants of Lantern Cottage, 19 Clara Drive, stating that the site as existing appears as 'lop sided' and that being directly opposite, it is their view of the property/green belt environment that is affected.

Councillor Andrew Carter has also expressed his support for the application.

## 7.0 CONSULTATIONS RESPONSES:

No consultations have been performed during the application process on this occasion.

## 8.0 PLANNING POLICIES:

### National

- PPS1 This document sets out the Government's overarching planning policies on the delivery of sustainable development through the planning system.
- PPG2 'Green Belts' – Green Belts (PPG2) outlines the history and extent of Green Belts and explains their purposes. There is a general presumption against inappropriate development within the Green Belt. Limited extensions may not be inappropriate development within the Green Belt provided that they do not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building.
- PPG 15 Planning and the Historic Environment - in reference to Listed Building Control - Alterations and Extensions. The policy states that in judging the effects of any alteration or extension, it is essential to have assessed the elements that make up the special interest in the building.

### Local

- Policy SG2 refers to maintaining and enhancing the character of the District of Leeds.
- Policy SG4 refers to ensuring development is consistent with the principles of sustainable development.
- Policy GP5 refers to proposals resolving detailed planning considerations (access, landscaping, design etc), seeking to avoid problems of environmental intrusion, loss of amenity, danger to health or life, pollution and highway congestion, and to maximise highway safety. Should have regard for guidance contained in any framework or planning brief for the site or area.
- Policy BD6 refers to the scale, form, materials and detailing of an extensions design in respect of the original building.
- Policy T2 refers to parking provision

Policy BC7	refers to the required use of traditional local materials.
Policy GB9	replacement dwellings in the Green Belt
Policy N37	Special Landscape Area
Policy N40	Urban Fringe Priority Area
Policy N12	spaces between buildings of importance, new buildings to be good neighbours and respect character and scale of surroundings
Policy N13	building design to be good quality and have regard to the character and appearance of surroundings.
Policies N18-22	seek to preserve and enhance areas designated as Conservation Areas, in order to ensure that not only does no detriment result from any form of built development but also that such development should seek to improve and enhance its setting wherever possible.

## 9.0 MAIN ISSUES

Green Belt / Special Landscape  
Design, character, detailing and materials  
Conservation Area

## 10.0 APPRAISAL

### 10.1 Green Belt / Special Landscape Area

The proposal cannot be supported with respect to the impact upon the Green Belt and Special Landscape Area. The negotiated approval for the host dwelling itself in 2007 acknowledged that the host dwelling as proposed was, in terms of PPG2, 'materially larger' with respect to the percentage increase in cubic volume beyond the dwelling it replaced.

It was accepted that there were very special circumstances to allow a larger dwelling, Officers negotiated with the applicant at the time of the application for the replacement dwelling which allowed the applicant to build a dwelling larger than the one it replaced. As described above, the City Council considers that the existence of an extant permission at the original property coupled with the other large extensions on Clara Drive were sufficient to allow a larger replacement dwelling.

Permitted Development Rights were removed as it was felt that no further additions would be allowed as any increase would be considered 'disproportionate additions' and therefore by definition harmful to the Green Belt.

However, the garage structure proposed here is considered unacceptable, introducing a garage with a further 146 cubic metres of volume. The sun room extension to the rear adds a further 73.5 cubic metres. Although the extensions as proposed constitute less than 50% of the original volume of the *new* dwelling, they take the volume well above the 100% increase of the previous dwelling the host now replaces. The additions are considered as 'disproportionate additions' to the dwelling and are by definition harmful to the Green Belt.

This site is within a Special Landscape Area where N37 of the Leeds Unitary Development Plan suggests development is acceptable only where it would not harm the character and appearance of the Landscape and when viewed from the highway, the introduction of a detached outbuilding would somewhat reduce the high scenic value of the trees to the south east of the site. Trees and natural/semi natural woods are identified as Positive Factors within the appendices to the Leeds Unitary Development Plan (Review ) 2006.

## 10.2 Design, character, detailing and materials

Despite a lack of acceptability with respect to Green Belt policy, the proposed garage is considered acceptable with respect to design, retaining key features of the host dwelling, such as a coursed stone facing, a slate roof, with art stone quoins to the corners. The visual theme of the host dwelling is retained. The rear extension is proposed in matching materials and is not out of scale with the existing. As such, the proposal is acceptable in this respect but this does not outweigh the points raised in 10.1.

## 10.3 Conservation Area

The applicant has proposed the use of a set of matching materials. The host dwelling is a new build property, though care has been taken to employ local materials to reflect the host's place within the Calverley Conservation Area. The replication of these materials within the proposed garage is considered acceptable. The street scene is a mixture of differing house types and styles and there is no single common design theme or set of key features within this section of the Conservation Area for the proposal to deviate from. The proposal is considered acceptable in respect of policies N18-22 of the Leeds Unitary Development Plan (Review) 2006 but is not considered wholly acceptable for reasons relating to the Green Belt context.

## 11.0 CONCLUSION

- 11.1 For the reasons outlined in the above report and taking into account all other material considerations it is recommended that planning permission should be refused, for the reasons set out above.

### **Background Papers:**

Application files 09/01348/FU, 07/01166/FU

Spg13 – 'Neighbourhoods for Living'

Calverley Conservation Area Appraisal

PPS2 – 'Green Belts'

1 Letter of support and letter from Councillor Andrew Carter



# WEST PLANS PANEL

Scale 1/ 1500

PRODUCED BY COMMUNICATIONS, GRAPHICS & MAPPING, LEEDS CITY COUNCIL  
This map is based upon the Ordnance Survey's Digital data with the permission of the Ordnance Survey on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.  
(c) Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown Copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings.  
(c) Crown Copyright. All rights reserved. Leeds City Council O.S. Licence No. - 100019667

